



ARTICLE

# I Have a Dream –On the Deductive Force of Logic in Politics

CP Hertogh\*

Chongqing University, People's Republic of China

\*Corresponding author. Email: noromyxo2005@gmail.com

(Received 29th June MMXX; | First published online 24th April MMXXII)

## Abstract

This proposal, which is derived from lectures and seminars for Chongqing University (CQ/CN) in 2013, is about to identify, analyze and interpret Martin Luther King Jr.'s 1963 speech 'I Have a Dream' as a thought experiment (TE). Although there have been many theological interpretations of the famous speech, we do not find any indication in this direction (except for a couple of references to the Bible since Rev. King was a Baptist minister). Instead we analyze it as a (double) deductive syllogism with as major premises phrases from (e.g.) article 1 of the USA 1776 Declaration of Independence and United Nations 1948 Declaration of Human Rights, featuring on equality and liberty. In the interpretations, we discuss some historical faults of logic and science, and try and answer the crucial question at the 50th anniversary of the speech in 2013—Has Martin Luther King Jr.'s dream come true 50 years later?

Keywords: dream; Martin Luther King Jr; thought experiment; thought experiment indicator; syllogism; Barbara; human rights

## 1. Introduction

Martin Luther King Jr.'s 1963 I Have a Dream, which originally referred to domestic American national affairs and has gained wide popularity across the globe, is given various interpretations in different contexts. In this paper, we will discuss the African American civil rights movement by analyzing its most famous speech by Martin Luther King Jr. (1929-1968). We shall make a paradigm shift from the common interpretations to logical analysis and interpretation of the central message of the speech. We will discuss it as an example of a global cross-cultural thought experiment (TE), e.g., referring not just to the USA Declaration of Independence (1776) and Convention (1787-1789), but also to international treaties

as Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen (1789) and Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948).

We will discuss the African American civil rights movement by analyses of its most famous paradigmatic speech, Martin Luther King's 1963 I Have a Dream (King 1963a/b) (note 1). There are quite a few religious and theological analyses and interpretations of the speech as after Biblical references in the speech (e.g. Amos 5, 24, Isaiah 40, 4-5), e.g. rhetoric of redemption (e.g. Bobbit 2004), reconstructive theology (e.g. Cook 1990) and personalism (e.g. Burrow 2006, Jarvis 2003). Shifting from the religious and theological analyses and interpretations of the speech, we discuss it as a (socio-)political argument, and abstract from specific Christian doctrines and connotations, while considering it as part of global pacifist civil rights movements, that followed Mahatma Gandhi's philosophy of Satyagraha (Sanskrit सत्याग्रह Pali satyāgraha), nonviolence practice (Sanskrit अहहिंसत्या Pāli avihiṃsā) and civil disobedience, by which Martin Luther King Jr (MLK hereafter) was surely inspired and influenced (note 2). In the last section, we will discuss the use of logic in critical thinking as the basis of our analysis and interpretation of I Have a Dream, touching on a couple of issues of this academic branch of knowledge, which may redeem logic and science after some of its historical blunders.

## 2. Surface Analysis of the Speech: Nine TE Indicators, the Core Argument

Our core analysis of this preminent TE from politics consists of three parts. First, 'I have a dream' is a TE indicator, like 'Consider' and 'Imagine'. Although one would expect an imperative, we assume from the example of Descartes's Cogito that 'I' may have a rhetorical, generalizing and universalizing sense, meaning, for example, 'we' (see Hertogh 2016 on Cogito). From the (pragmatic) situation of the speech, delivered in Washington in 1963 at the end of the March on Washington for Jobs and Freedom, addressing a huge audience of mostly Black, brown, colored people, we understand that it signifies 'Let's have a dream'.

Second, the TE indicator 'I have a dream' is used nine times in an emphatic way (cf. Zheng 2014, 126-127), whereby the TE becomes central to the rhetorics and contents of the speech, that can be considered an extended TE with, in fact, not just one TE but multiple, nine TE, each focusing on a particular instance of local, discriminatory social injustice in USA of the 1960s and before.

Third, the main argument is of deductive nature, saying: [1]

$P_1$  All Americans are free and equal

$P_2$  Black American are Americans

---

$C$  Black Americans are free and equal to (white) Americans (note 3)

The inference made from the very TE—MLKs dream—is that this logical argument will become true, deducing from Emancipation Proclamation (1863) and USA Declaration of Independence (1776). Given that it is already logically true, we could add that it will become a social reality in USA. Consider the following excerpt:

I have a dream that one day this nation will rise up and live out the true meaning of its creed:

'We hold these truths to be self-evident, that all men are created equal.'

The quote is derived from the first part of the first article of the American Declaration of Independence, indicated by MLK as the 'creed' of USA, referred to as 'the American dream' when MLK uses the TE indicator for the first time.

And so even though we face the difficulties of today and tomorrow, I still have a dream.

It is a dream deeply rooted in the American dream.

It is exactly in front of the giant statue of Abraham Lincoln, the 16th President of USA (1861-1865) and issuer of the Emancipation Proclamation, ‘in whose shadow we stand today’, the Lincoln Memorial on the Mall in Washington, that the speech was spoken on August 28, 1963—and filmed, one can watch the video on YouTube (King 1963a).

### 3. Logical Analysis: Double Deductive Syllogism (Barbara)

As it is about a deductive logical argument, reducible to (double) categorical syllogism Barbara with two predicates, free and equal, all three premises are considered categorically, definitely true, e.g. self-evident (note 4). The logical force of the major premise (see, e.g., [1],  $P_1$ , first premise or major) goes far beyond the usual probability status of TE as enthymemes (which belong to Aristotle’s rhetorical syllogisms). And so it is with the logical force of the minor premise (see, e.g., [1],  $P_2$ , second premise or minor). In fact, a logical assumption like ‘all triangles are polygons’ or ‘all apples are fruits’ is a traditional categorical truth. Barbara is considered a valid type of inference. It follows that also the conclusion (see e.g. [1], C, conclusion) is categorically true. Applying quantified predicate logic (cf. Copi et al. 444, 452-453), considering the property of equality a two-place predicate letter, we arrive at next formula [2]:

[2]

Suppose

$Ax$  :  $x$  is an American (citizen)

$Bx$  :  $x$  is a Black American (citizen) (African American) (note 3)

$Exy$  :  $x$  is equal to  $y$

$x, y$  : persons, human beings

$\forall xy$  : universal quantifier—for all  $x, y$ , it holds (that) ...

$\rightarrow$  : material implication—if ..., then ...

$\forall xy(Ax, Ay \rightarrow Exy)$  All Americans are Equal  
 $\forall xy(Bx, By \rightarrow Ax, Ay)$  If one is a Black American, then one is an American

---

$\forall xy(Ax, By \rightarrow Exy)$  If there are an American and a Black American, then they are Equal

The analysis of MLKs speech applies higher-order quantified predicate logic; a PWS (possible world semantics) analysis, involving PW (possible worlds), is also possible but not necessary. Propositional logic cannot express the difference between ‘all’ (universal quantifier  $\forall x$ ) and ‘some’ (existential quantifier  $\exists x$ ). Just because the argument is, principally speaking, about exactly and inclusively all Americans, the premises of the argument get deductive, decisive truth values, and its inference the logical strength of a mathematical proof. The international treaties, both preceding the speech, don’t only state the quality of equality in the first article, but also freedom. Article 1 of the 1789 Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen states

Men are born and remain free and equal in rights....

And, Article 1 of the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights states

All human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights....

We consider both USA Declaration of Independence and Constitution part of the same Enlightenment philosophy as Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen, as they were conceived in about the same time. Our consideration follows Dr. King’s use of the word ‘free(dom)’ twenty-five times (five times ‘free’, twenty times ‘freedom’) and the word ‘liberty’ twice in his speech—and not foremost in religious or theological sense, but in legal sense as to refer to e.g. ‘the “unalienable Rights” of “Life, Liberty and the pursuit of Happiness”’ as guaranteed by the second part of the first article of the Declaration of Independence (note 5)—and since we supplement the logical analysis by a similar syllogism, featuring predicate ‘free’, as we have already summarized the main argument of the speech as including both qualities of equality and freedom (see [1])

[3]

Suppose

$Fx : x$  is free

$\forall x(Ax \rightarrow Fx)$  All Americans (USA citizens) are Free

$\forall x(Bx \rightarrow Ax)$  If one is a Black American, then one is an American

---

$\forall x(Bx \rightarrow Fx)$  All Black Americans are Free

As there are more formalizations possible, a second formalization will be added here. The argument scheme of both formulas [2] and [3] can be reduced to instantiations of syllogism Barbara, going back to Aristotle’s Prior Analytics and subsequent medieval commentaries (note 4), e.g., All Humans are Mortal; All Greeks are Humans; so, All Greeks are Mortal. That is in a sort of syllogism notation, e.g., HaM, GaH, so, GaM, where ‘Humans’ is the middle term, ‘Mortal’ predicate, ‘Greeks’ subject, ‘a’ (from affirmo) signifying, e.g., ‘All’, categorical syllogism. When A stands for Americans, B for Black (or African) Americans, E for Equal and F for Free, it results in next double universal affirmative syllogism Barbara—resp. [4] and [5]

[4]

AaE All Americans are Equal  
 BaA Black/African Americans are Americans

---

BaE Black/African American are Equal (to (white) Americans)

[5]

AaF All Americans are Free  
 BaA Black/African Americans are Americans

---

BaF Black/African Americans are Free

The schemata are not ambiguous, but it is, let’s say, a double schema. The core argument of I Have a Dream is a contraction of two arguments that are both examples of syllogism Barbara. The argument is explicated by means of formula [2] and [3] that can both be reduced to Barbara by the above additional formulas [4] and [5]. The traditional and ancient origin of the argument refutes modern criticisms as Peirce’s (see e.g. Wikipedia entry on C.S. Peirce —retrieved on March 25, 2022) (note 6).

### 3.1 All Swans are White

This section touches on a couple of historical blunders in the history of western logic and science. Structurally, the argument is related to the historical falsification of one of the standard examples of logic in the Middle Ages. The statement ‘all swans are white’ was once considered a (preeminent) example of an analytical statement that was regarded true, like a geometrical proposition, such as ‘a triangle has three sides’ It was falsified by the discovery of black swans in Australia at the end of the 17th century, when the first black swan was recorded by Willem de Vlamingh in the Swan River in Western Australia in 1697 (note 7). Black swans were initially categorized as a monotypic genus, and only later classified as species of the genus of *Cygnus* (Swans) together with European white swans.

Similarly, the exclusively white qualification, predication of the definition of human beings, both in scientific and religious contexts, both in Europe and North America, was falsified quite late in history, as, first, by the abolishment of slavery in 1863 by the Emancipation Proclamation and 1865 ratification of the 13th Amendment to the Constitution; and, second, by full African American suffrage in 1870 by the 15th Amendment to the Constitution.

Literature as Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass (Douglass 1845) and Harriet Beecher Stowe’s 1852 *Uncle Tom’s Cabin*, which is estimated to have sold nearly as many copies as the Bible in the 19th century, had contributed to the popularization of the abolitionist philosophy.

However, the emancipation has been retarded by many regressive, conservative setbacks and discriminatory practices, such as racial segregation policies in public spaces, education, etc., to which MLK refers, e.g.

I have a dream that one day on the red hills of Georgia, the sons of former slaves and the sons of former slave owners will be able to sit down together at the table of brotherhood.

.....

I have a dream that one day, down in Alabama, with its vicious racists, with its governor having his lips dripping with the words of ‘interposition’ and ‘nullification’—one day right there in Alabama, little black boys and black girls will be able to join hands with little white boys and white girls as sisters and brothers.

These are two of the sub-TE, as with regard to freedom and equality for Black Americans. The fifth one states the famous phrase about color of skin and content of character

I have a dream that my four little children will one day live in a nation where they will not be judged by the color of their skin but by the content of their character.

MLKs speech contributed immediately to the abolishment of racial segregation in USA public life and schools, which was established in 1968 all over USA when all forms of segregation were declared unconstitutional by the Supreme Court (note 8).

### 3.2 *Has Martin Luther King Jr.’s Dream Come True?*

One of the questions around the 50th anniversary of the speech was: Has MLKs dream come true 50 years later? This question was answered by President Barack Obama in a speech commemorating the 50th anniversary of the March on Washington, paying tribute to MLKs I Have a Dream, drawing the effects of the march from change ‘not just for African Americans’ and USA onto hope and change for ‘the entire world’. Obama (2013c) notes

Because they marched, America became more free and more fair, not just for African Americans but for women and Latinos, Asians and Native Americans; for Catholics, Jews and Muslims; for gays, for Americans with disabilities. America changed for you and for me. And the entire world drew strength from that example, whether it be young people who watched from the other side of an Iron Curtain and would eventually tear down that wall, or the young people inside South Africa who would eventually end the scourge of apartheid.

However, Prof. Cornel West (a/o) has accused President Obama of abusing the MLK Bible for militarist practices as drones (‘a drone president’), since the African American MLK legacy has become more and more anti-militarist because of Dr. King’s resistance against the Vietnam war (see West 2012, King 1967a, b). Of course, the societal position of these African American men, resp. 44th President of USA, and Professor at Harvard and Princeton University, proves that many things have changed for the better for African Americans in USA. Still, there remain many complaints about social, economic and judicial inequality, focusing on poverty and police brutality, among other disturbing widespread issues affecting African Americans.

Cornel West engaged in the Occupy Wall Street protests in 2011 (West 2011—a revolution to transform power from ‘the greed of Wall Street oligarchs’ to everyday people and poor children of ‘all colors and all cultures and all genders and all sexual orientations’, responding to the Arab Spring, ‘Martin Luther King Jr. will smile from the grave’) (note 9) and a Poverty Tour (with Tavis Smiley) one year before the 2012 Presidential elections; Rev. Jesse Jackson called for a War on Poverty in 2010; and at the second inauguration of President Barack Obama in 2012, Martin Luther King III, son of Martin Luther King Jr., stated there is ‘hardly no progress’ in the field of poverty, a ‘huge area we have to work on as a nation.’

The spate of police brutality keeps on shocking the USA. Examples include February 2012 police brutality with the shooting of Trayvon Martin and the subsequent acquittal of his killer, George Zimmerman, in July 2013. Next, in March 2013, Kimani Gray was shot dead by two

police officers in Brooklyn, New York, triggering nights of riots, while the officers were not charged and one of them won Cop of the Year Award. And, in August 2014, police brutality was made manifest in the gruesome murder of Michael Brown in Ferguson, Missouri, where the protesters urgently demanded justice for Michael Brown. But the demand remained in vain because his shooter, officer Darren Wilson, still hasn't been arrested and tried till date. These brutalities triggered a new African American movement, Black Lives Matter (BLM), to protest police violence against Black Americans (see e.g. Havercroft and Owen 2016). These are only a few examples of unarmed Black youngsters out of a total of 221, who have been killed by USA police for no cogent reason (West 2013). Eventually, a police officer, Derek Chauvin, was convicted of murder in 2021 after graphic killing of handcuffed George Floyd, by pressing his knee on Floyd's neck for over 9 minutes in Minneapolis, Minnesota, which had raised international 'I can't breathe' protests all over the globe in COVID-19 pandemic year 2020. Still, hundreds of young Black (male and female) victims of police brutality are demanding justice.

MLK often warned against police brutality. King Jr. (1963a/b) has decried the situation viz:

...We can never be satisfied as long as the Negro is the victim of the unspeakable horrors of police brutality...

....

...And some of you have come from areas where your quest – quest for freedom left you battered by the storms of persecution and staggered by the winds of police brutality

....

Dr. King was killed on April 7, 1968. His assassination was followed by nationwide riots. His family claimed the assassination was a government conspiracy. The assassination of MLK came just a few weeks before the Poor People's Campaign in June 1968, organized by Dr. King and the Southern Christian Leadership Conference (SCLC), of whom MLK had been the first president. The issue of poverty is also captured in the speech:

One hundred years later [i.e. after the Emancipation Proclamation of 1863], the Negro lives on a lonely island of poverty in the midst of a vast ocean of material prosperity.

2014 movie *Selma*, *One Dream Can Change the World* is about the 1965 voting rights marches that eventually contributed to election of Barack Obama as the first African American President of USA in 2009. Ava DuVernay's movie tells the story of Dr. King's engagement in resistance against obstruction of African American voting rights in Selma, Alabama. One of the first scenes shows King Jr. receiving the Nobel Peace Prize and—amidst racist police brutality on Bloody Sunday, Turnaround Tuesday and March on Montgomery—we see him communicating immediately with USA President Lyndon B. Johnson, who talks about a War on Poverty and finally signs the Voting Rights Act of 1965. President Johnson had already signed the 1964 Civil Rights Act, prepared by his predecessor John F. Kennedy, which ended legal segregation, and would next sign the 1968 Civil Rights Act, which focused on fair housing policy.

Nominated for two Grammy's and four Golden Globe Awards the film won Best Song Award for 'Glory', written by Common and John Legend e.g.

....

The movement is a rhythm to us  
 Freedom is like religion to us  
 Justice is juxtaposition in us  
 Justice for all just ain't specific enough

....

That's why Rosa sat on the bus  
 That's why we walk through Ferguson with our hands up

....

Now we right the wrongs in history

....

(Stephens and Lynn 2014)

In 2021 H.E.R. was awarded a Grammy (a/o) for Song of the Year for 'I Can't Breathe'

....

Because of your audacity  
 To say all men are created equal in the eyes of God  
 But disparage a man based on the color of his skin  
 Do not say you do not see color  
 When you see us, see us

We can't breathe

[Silence is violence]

....

(Wilson et al. 2020)(note 10)

Video to the song (H.E.R. 2020) shows images from the national and international BLM movement, that Barack Obama compares to the civil rights movement of the sixties, one day after the anniversary of George Floyd's death, May 25, 2021 (Obama et al. 2021).

#### 4. Conclusion

Surface analyses may identify Dr. King's 1963 I Have a Dream as a thought experiment as with help of TE indicator 'I have a dream', possibly meaning 'Let's have a dream'. Next, we may identify nine sub-TE, describing nine recoveries from discriminatory racist situations all over United States of America. Logical deep analyses show that the core TE is reducible to double syllogism Barbara with as major premises clauses from 1776 Declaration of Independence, 1787 Constitution, and 1789, 1948 Declarations of Human Rights, involving liberty and equality. As part of interpretations we discuss America's ongoing racial problems, caused by western historic collective crime of slavery, from protest marches in days of MLK to contemporary BLM (Black Lives Matter) protests against, e.g., segregation, obstruction of voting rights, police murders and brutality, poverty etc. The 50th anniversary of the speech could be celebrated by the first African American President of USA, Barack Hussein Obama (2009-2017), and our analyses of the speech may be considered Obamaesque in their emphasis on constitutional law, that could have driven both MLK and Harvard law graduate BHO, who had both won the Nobel Peace Prize in, resp., 1964 and 2009 (note 11).

Noam Chomsky, together with e.g. *New York Times*, points out that BLM is ‘an astonishingly successful movement’, ‘solidarity of black and white’, demonstrations getting large public support ‘way beyond what MLK achieved at the peak of his popularity in 1963’, both absolutely and relatively speaking (please, see Buchanan et al. 2020, Chomsky 2020, 2021a, b).

## Notes

note 1 - There are many schools named in honor of MLK. Since 1986-2018 his birthday, January 15, is yearly commemorated as an American holiday, called Martin Luther King Day, the third Monday in January. In 1986, it was celebrated for the first time, in 2000 it was observed in all states of USA as a paid holiday to all state employees, and on January 12, 2018, Pres. Donald Trump proclaimed Martin Luther King Jr. Day, officially a Federal Holiday (see Trump 2018). Many of the important places in the life of MLK have turned into historic sites and museums. In August 2011, a Martin Luther King Memorial was opened on the Mall in Washington DC. In Europe, MLK is remembered by, e.g., a statue in West Minster Abbey, London, showing him as one out of ten 20th-century martyrs. Critics as FBI (Federal Bureau of Investigation) would point out some unfair, untrue criticisms as that MLK would have been a (a) ‘womanizer’, having extra-marital affairs—which is disputed, as being biased and partisan gossip, since the same agency together with CIA is mentioned among possible plotters of his assassination; (b) ‘Communist’—which can be disputed on the same grounds, adding that there is no evidence to prove that MLK was a member of any Communist political party or whatsoever, or served under a Communist regime, contributing to holocausts and crimes against humanity, Communism was associated with (quite different from e.g. Martin Heidegger, whose membership of the German Nazi Party and lack of criticism of the Nazi regime in later years discredits him as a philosopher); lastly, (c) MLKs early death at 39 may point to infertility of his thoughts—however, this argument is easily refuted by counterexamples as Jesus Christ’s, who died at 33, and John F. Kennedy’s, who died at 46, five years before MLK. Cornel West is, generally speaking, extremely positive about MLK, in TV interviews comparing MLK favorably to Pres. Obama, but also in his writings as West 1993/2017, although occasionally there are some minor criticisms as alleged sexism, homophobia and ‘relatively undemocratic character of his organization’ (45). West adds some female activists to the mainly masculine protagonists as MLK and Malcolm X, ‘Malcolm, Martin, Ella and Fannie’ (e.g. 38), Ella Baker and Fannie Lou Hamer. With inauguration of Barack Obama as 44th President in 2009, who was reelected in 2013, Black organization must have become fully democratic. In his second term Pres. Obama was pleading for equality of LGBTQ people and same-sex marriage (‘Our journey is not complete until our gay brothers and sisters are treated like anyone else under the law ...’ Obama 2013a, cf. Wesley et al. 2011).

note 2 - In Dr. King’s speech, we encounter view of religious pluralism (e.g. Hick 1966) e.g. in ‘all of God’s children, black men and white men, Jews and Gentiles, Protestants and Catholics’ (possibly alluding to Galatians 3, 28, ‘There is neither Jew nor Gentile, neither slave nor free, nor is there male and female, for you are all one in Christ Jesus’), still reducing its application to USA as a nation instead of all of the Planet. The latter global extension is made by Pres. Obama at the 50th commemoration of the March on Washington, although West criticizes the President’s militarism, that may be implied by the President’s extension, but which was not intended by MLKs nonviolence, particularly MLKs criticism of the imperialist war in Vietnam.

note 3 - Although the words ‘Black American,’ ‘African American,’ ‘Black’ and ‘Negro’ may be considered synonymous, they differ in connotations. For example, ‘Negro’

is considered defamatory, an insult and it is for that reason indicated as the ‘N-word.’ According to West, ‘Negro’ refers to the unfree, slave status of Africans who were involuntarily transported to America in a most brutal and cruel way (e.g. West 2013, Galeano 1971/1997) as portrayed in many historical sources, documentaries, TV serials and movies; different from most of the immigrant population of USA, they came to America against their will. In terms of 1948 Human Rights it is not only about violation of art. 1 (free and equal in rights), but violation of about all of the thirty articles, e.g., art. 4 (freedom from slavery), art. 5 (freedom from torture or cruel, inhuman, degrading treatment).

note 4 - Aristotle’s syllogisms are a complex doctrine, that has been further developed in the European Middle Ages, involving twenty-four valid syllogisms, of which Barbara is only one specimen, consisting of three universal affirmative propositions; the vowels of the name Barbara indicate it is about three (universal) affirmative (a from affirmo) propositions. One may argue that in our analysis of MLK ‘free and equal’ is not about a category noun, but, in fact, two adjectives, predicates. Because it is dual we analyze it as double Barbara, because they are predicates we additionally analyze with help of predicate logic. The criticism that they are adjectives instead of nouns may be countered by adding hidden category of person, citizen or, most generally, entity; citizen would do best here. For procedure of adding logical symbolism of predicate logic including quantifiers, please, see e.g. Copi et al. 2014, 453. It is about quantified higher-order predicate logic because there is a relation involved, Exy: x is equal to y.

note 5 - These words of the Founding Fathers couldn’t prevent criticisms of white supremacy, systemic racism etc. in, e.g., USA police and justice, including, e.g., racial profiling, e.g., West 1993/2017

Yet the legacy of white supremacy lingers—often in the face of the very denials of its realities. The most visible examples are racial profiling, drug convictions (black people consume 12 percent of illegal drugs in America yet suffer nearly 70 percent of its convictions!), and death-row executions. And the less visible ones are unemployment levels, infant mortality rates, special education placements, and psychic depression treatments. (West 2017, viii)

note 6 - See [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Charles\\_Sanders\\_Peirce](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Charles_Sanders_Peirce) (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Slavery, the American Civil War, and racism

Peirce grew up in a home where ... slavery was considered natural ... Peirce liked to use the syllogism to illustrate the unreliability of traditional forms of logic ....

All Men are equal in their political rights.

Negroes are Men.

Therefore, Negroes are equal in political rights to whites.

Wikipedia refers to Louis Menand’s 2002 Pulitzer Prize for History winning *The Metaphysical Club*.

note 7 - See e.g. Wikipedia on black swan. The issue of white and black swans is discussed in, e.g., Hempel 1945a, b, Popper 1959/2002, and it belongs to inductive logic; in Hertogh 2020 we discuss it as an example of a paradigm shift in biology.

note 8 - Together with more demonstrations, manifestations and strikes by the African American civil rights movement, e.g., the 1955-56 Montgomery Bus Boycot initiated by Rosa Parks who refused to give her seat to a white American.

note 9 - The Occupy Wall Street (OWS) protests is the American name for the international social movement of Indignados (Indignants) or Movimiento 15-M, which started on

May 15, 2011, on Puerto del Sol in Madrid, Spain, and resulted in an election victory of Podemos—led by Pablo Iglesias Turrión, writer and Professor of Political Science Department of Complutense University Madrid—in the European Parliament elections of 2014, where the new political party won 8% of the votes. In France, the Mouvement des Indignés is associated with Prof. Philippe Corcuff of the Institute of Political Studies Lyon, and University of Paris (former Paris V).

note 10 - West often refers to songs as part of African American legacy, e.g., Bob Marley and The Wailers (West 2011, ‘ ... wailing, not whining ... ’ West 2013), George Clinton (‘chocolate cities and vanilla suburbs’ West 2017, 5), Sly and the Family Stone ( ‘everyday people’ West 2017, 104). By awarding Nobel Literature Prize to Bob Dylan in 2016, one of the most prominent proponents of the USA civil rights and anti-war movements, ‘the great American song tradition’ has been honored.

note 11 - Both Obamas have studied law at Harvard, and Barack Obama has been teaching constitutional law at the University of Chicago for twelve years, from 1992 to 2004.

### Acknowledgments

This paper is derived from (e.g.) seminar ‘Logic and Argumentation: Thought Experiments Capita Selecta’, delivered at Chongqing University (CQ/CN) in the first term of 2013-2014. Martin Luther King Jr’s I Have a Dream appeared the most popular TE, just before Albert Einstein’s Elevator and Chasing a Beam of Light. Thanks to teacher assistant Li Xiao (肖礼 Shirley), and students. A draft of the text appears in unpublished provisional VUB Brussels (BE/EU) PhD dissertation ‘Semantics of Thought Experiments’ (Hertogh 2015a, 52-59) as introduction to section on ‘Logic and Critical Thinking’ .

### References

- Anselm. 1965. *St. Anselm’s Proslogion with A Reply on Behalf of the Fool by Gaunilo and The Author’s Reply to Gaunilo*. Trans. with an Introduction and Philosophical Commentary by Charlesworth, M.J.. Clarendon Press: Oxford.
- Aristotle. 1908-1952. *The Works of Aristotle, Translated into English under the Editorship of W.D. Ross, 12 Vols*. Clarendon Press: Oxford.
- Bassham, Greg, Irwin, William, Nardonne, Henry and James M. Wallace. 2002. *Critical Thinking, A Student’s Introduction*. McGraw-Hill: Boston.
- Beecher Stowe, Harriet. 1852. *Uncle Tom’s Cabin*. John P. Jewett: Boston.
- Bobbitt, David A. 2004. *The Rhetoric of Redemption: Kenneth Burke’s Redemption Drama and Martin Luther King Jr. ‘I Have a Dream’ Speech*. Rowman and Littlefield: Lanham.
- Buchanan, Larry, Bui, Quoctrung, and Jugal K. Patel. 2020. ‘Black Lives Matter May Be the Largest Movement in U.S. History, Black Lives Matter protests on June 6’. *New York Times* (July 3, 2020).
- Burrow, Jr., Rufus. 2006. *God and Human Dignity: The Personalism, Theology, and Ethics of Martin Luther King*. University of Notre Dame Press: Notre Dame.
- Chomsky, Noam. 2020. ‘Noam Chomsky and Susan Neiman: Black Lives Matter, Universalism and Hopes for the Left’. *EinsteinForum*. [Video] <https://www.einsteinforum.de/veranstaltungen/black-lives-matter-universalism-and-hopes-for-the-left/> (retrieved March 25, 2022)
- Chomsky, N., Derber, Charles, Moodliar, Suren, and Paul Shannon. 2021a. *Chomsky for Activists*. Routledge: London.
- Chomsky N. 2021b. ‘Noam Chomsky without Regrets: Interview with a Libertarian Socialist, Noam Chomsky Interviewed by Kelly Candaele’. *Capital Main* (April 9, 2021).

Cook, Anthony E. 1990. 'Beyond Critical Legal Studies: The Reconstructive Theology of Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr.' *Harvard Law Review*, 103.5: 985-1044.

Common and John Legend. 2014. 'SELMA - Official "Glory" Music Video: Common and John Legend'. [YouTube] <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=A3FiZ82aAd8> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Copi, Irving M., Cohen, Carl, and Kenneth McMahon. 2010. *Introduction to Logic*, 14th Edition. Prentice Hall: Upper Saddle River (NJ).

Douglass, Frederick. 1845. *Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass*. The Anti-slavery Office: Boston.

DuVernay, Ava. 2014. *Selma, One Dream Can Change the World*. Paramount Pictures, 20th Century Fox, StudioCanal. [Movie]

Einstein, Albert, and Leopold Infeld. 1938. *The Evolution of Physics—From Early Concept to Relativity and Quanta*. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge.

Galeano, Eduardo. 1997. *Open Veins of Latin America, Five Centuries of the Pillage of a Continent*. Translated by Cedric Belfrage, Foreword by Isabel Allende. 25th anniversary edition. (First Spanish Ed. 1971 Siglo XXI Editores; First English Ed. 1973 Monthly Review Press) Latin America Bureau: London.

Havercroft, Jonathan, and David Owen. 2016. 'Soul-Blindness, Police Orders and Black Lives Matter: Wittgenstein, Cavell, and Rancière.' *Political Theory*, 44.6: 739–763.

Hempel, Carl G. 1945a. 'Studies in the Logic of Confirmation (I).' *Mind*, NS, 54.214 (January 1945): 1-26.

Hempel, C.G. 1945b. 'Studies in the Logic of Confirmation (II).' *Mind*, NS, 54.214 (April 1945): 97-121.

H.E.R. 2020. 'I Can't Breathe (Official Video)'. [YouTube] [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=E-1Bf\\_XWaPE](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=E-1Bf_XWaPE) (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Hertogh, C. Peter. 2013. 'Scientific Methodology and Critical Thinking', Open Lecture April 11, 2013. Chongqing University: Chongqing (CQ/CN). [PPT, Video]

Hertogh, C.P. 2015a. 'Semantics of Thought Experiments'. Prov. PhD dissertation Philosophy. VUB Brussels: Brussels (BE/EU).

Hertogh, C.P. 2015b. 'Ibn Sīnā's Flying Man—Logical Analyses of a (Religious) Thought Experiment.' *Journal of Islamic Philosophy*, 9: 54-74.

Hertogh, C.P. 2016. 'Thought Experiment Analyses of René Descartes' Cogito.' *Transform/Ação*, 39.3: 9-22.

Hertogh, C.P. 2018. 'Logical Analyses of Vipassanā Meditation.' *Contemporary Buddhism*, 19.2: 251-274.

Hertogh, C.P. 2020. 'Goodman's Grue—Relativized Pluralism and Paradigmatic Thought Experiment (Whack).' *Humanities Bulletin*, 3.1: 64-103.

Hick, John. 1966. *Faith and Knowledge*. (First Ed. 1957) Cornell University Press: Ithaca (NY).

Jarvis, Dara. 2003. 'Martin Luther King, Jr.: Personalism Philosophy'. *Legacy Scholarly Journal*, 2.1: 55-58.

King, Martin Luther Jr. 1963a. 'Martin Luther King - I Have A Dream Speech - August 28, 1963'. [Video] <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=smEqnklfYs> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

King, M.L. Jr. 1963b. 'Martin Luther King, Jr., I Have a Dream, delivered 28 August 1963, at the Lincoln Memorial, Washington D.C.'. *American Rhetoric*. [Transcript] <http://www.americanrhetoric.com/speeches/mlkihavedream.htm> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

King, M.L. Jr. 1967a. 'Beyond Vietnam – A Time to Break Silence, Delivered 4 April 1967, Riverside Church, New York City.' *American Rhetoric*. [Transcript] <http://www.>

americanrhetoric.com/speeches/mlkatimetobreaksilence.htm (retrieved March 25, 2022)

King, M.L. Jr. 1967b. 'Why I Am Opposed to the War in Vietnam –Full Speech.wmv.' (April 30, 1967 Sermon) [Audio] [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zyE4eo\\_leX8](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zyE4eo_leX8) (retrieved March 25, 2022)

King, Martin Luther III. 2012. 'Martin Luther King III: "We Are losing Our liberties"' [Video] <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=E0nvEMRofg0> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Menand, Louis. 2001. *The Metaphysical Club: A Story of Ideas in America*. Farrar, Straus and Giroux: New York.

Moore, Brooke N., and Richard Parker. 1992. *Critical Thinking*, 3rd Edition. Mayfield: Mountain View (CA).

Obama, Barack H. 2004. *Dreams from my Father, A Story of Race and Inheritance*. Canongate: Edinburgh.

Obama, B.H. 2006. *The Audacity of Hope, Thoughts on Reclaiming the American Dream*. Random House: New York.

Obama, B.H. 2008a. 'Barack Obama: 'A More Perfect Union' (Full Speech)'. [Video] <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zrp-v2tHaDo> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Obama, B.H. 2008b. 'A More Perfect Union "The Race Speech" Philadelphia, PA, March 18, 2008'. *Obamaspeeches.com* [Transcript] <http://obamaspeeches.com/E05-Barack-Obama-A-More-Perfect-Union-the-Race-Speech-Philadelphia-PA-March-18-2008.htm> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Obama, B.H. Pres. 2013a. 'Barack Obama, Second Presidential Inaugural Address, delivered 21 January 2013, Washington, D.C.' [Transcript, Video] <https://www.americanrhetoric.com/speeches/barackobama/barackobamasecondinauguraladdress.htm> (retr. March 25, 2022)

Obama, B.H., Pres. 2013b. 'Barack Obama, Remarks on Trayvon Martin, delivered 19 July 2013'. *American Rhetoric*. [Transcript, Video] <http://www.americanrhetoric.com/speeches/barackobama/barackobamatrayvonmartin.htm> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Obama, B.H., Pres. 2013c. 'Barack Obama, Address at the "Let Freedom Ring" Ceremony Commemorating the 50th Anniversary of the March on Washington, D.C., delivered 28 August 2013, Lincoln Memorial, Washington, D.C.'. *American Rhetoric*. [Transcript, Video] <http://www.americanrhetoric.com/speeches/barackobama/barackobamaletfreedomringceremony.htm> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Obama, B.H. 2020. *A Promised Land*. Random House: New York.

Obama, B.H. et al. 2021. 'My Brother's Keeper Alliance Leadership Forum: A Conversation with President Obama'. [Video] <https://www.obama.org/mbka2/leadership-forum/>, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=y0bjqFj2oxU> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Obama, Michelle 2018. *Becoming*. Random House: New York.

Popper, Karl R. 1959/2002. *The Logic of Scientific Discovery*. First English Trans. 1959. Routledge: London.

Rini, Adriane A. 2003. 'When Time Is of the Essence: Prior Analytics 1.15 and De Caelo 1.12'. *Logique et Analyse*, 46 (183/184): 419-440.

Russell, Bertrand, and Albert Einstein et al. 1955. *The Russell-Einstein Manifesto* 9 July 1955. <https://pugwash.org/1955/07/09/statement-manifesto/> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Schilpp, Paul A. ed. 1969. *Albert Einstein—Philosopher Scientist*. Third Ed. (First Pub. 1949) Open Court, Cambridge University Press: La Salle (IL), Cambridge.

Smith, Robin. 1989. *Aristotle: Prior Analytics Translated, with Introduction, Notes, and Commentary*. Hackett: Indianapolis.

Seelig, Carl. ed. 1956. *Helle Zeit—Dunkle Zeit*, In *Memoriam Albert Einstein*. Europa Verlag: Zürich.

Stephens, John Roger, and Lonnie Rashid Lynn. 2014. 'John Legend and Common Lyrics "Glory" (from "Selma" soundtrack)'. AZLyrics.com <https://www.azlyrics.com/lyrics/johnlegend/glory.htm> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Teays, Wanda. 1996. *Second Thoughts, Critical Thinking from a Multicultural Perspective*. Mayfield: Mountain View (CA).

Trump, Donald J. Pres. 2018. 'Remarks by President Trump at Signing of Proclamation to Honor Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Day.' <https://trumpwhitehouse.archives.gov/briefings-statements/remarks-president-trump-signing-proclamation-honor-dr-martin-luther-king-jr-day/> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Wertheimer, Max. 1959. *Productive Thinking*. Harper and Bros: New York.

Wesley, Joan Marshall, Dometz-Hendrix, Ercilla, and Jasmine N. Williams. 2011. 'Moving Forward: Advancing Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender under the Obama Administration through Progressive Politics'. *Race, Gender and Class*, 18.3-4: 150-168.

West, Cornel R. 2004. *Democracy Matters: Winning the Fight against Imperialism*. Penguin Press: New York.

West, C.R. 2011. 'Cornel West on Occupy Wall Street It's the Makings of a U S Autumn Responding to the Arab Spring.' (incl. We the People Have Found Our Voice. Occupy Wall Street General Assembly September 27, 2011) [Video] [https://www.democracynow.org/2011/9/29/cornel\\_west\\_on\\_occupy\\_wall\\_street\\_its\\_the\\_makings\\_of\\_a\\_us\\_autumn\\_responding\\_to\\_the\\_arab\\_spring](https://www.democracynow.org/2011/9/29/cornel_west_on_occupy_wall_street_its_the_makings_of_a_us_autumn_responding_to_the_arab_spring) (retrieved March 25, 2022)

West, C.R. 2012. 'Cornel West: Obama Doesn't Deserve to Be Sworn in on Martin Luther King Jr's Bible.' [Video] <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=d-G8tp7mGYc> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

West, C.R. 2013. 'Cornel West: Obama's Response to Trayvon Martin Case Belies Failure to Challenge "New Jim Crow".' [Video] <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zCO4BxUMpD0> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

West, C.R. 2017. *Race Matters, 25th Anniversary: With a New Introduction*. (First Ed. 1993) Beacon Press: Boston.

Wilson, Gabriella[, Emile II, Dernst, and Tiara Thomas.] 2020. 'H.E.R. -I Can't Breathe lyrics'. <https://www.lyricsmode.com/her-i-cant-breathe-1760971.html> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Wittgenstein, Ludwig J.J. 1953. *Philosophical Investigations*. Basil Blackwell: Oxford.

Wittgenstein, L. 1961. *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*. Trans. McGuinness, B.F., and D.F. Pears and with the Introduction by Bertrand Russell. Routledge and Kegan Paul: London, New York.

Zheng, Shaohui. 2014. 'A Stylistic Analysis on "I Have A Dream"'. *Journal of Studies in Social Sciences*, 9.1: 123-134.

Documents, Charters, Treaties

Constitution of the United States (1787-1789)

<https://www.archives.gov/founding-docs/constitution-transcript> (retr. March 25, 2022)

Declaration of Independence (1776)

<https://www.archives.gov/founding-docs/declaration-transcript> (retr. March 25, 2022)

Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen (1789)

<https://www.wdl.org/en/item/14430/> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Emancipation Proclamation (1863)

<https://www.archives.gov/exhibits/featured-documents/emancipation-proclamation> (retrieved March 25, 2022)

Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948)

<https://www.un.org/en/about-us/universal-declaration-of-human-rights> (retrieved March 25, 2022)